

900 S.W. Jackson Street, Suite 600 Topeka, Kansas 66612-1212 (785) 296-3203

www.ksde.org

Danny Zeck District 1

Dr. Deena Horst

District 6

Melanie Haas District 2

Dennis Hershberger

District 7

Michelle Dombrosky District 3

District 4 Jim Porter

Ann F. Mah

Betty J. Arnold District 8

District 9

Minutes Blue Ribbon Task Force on Student Screen Time October 17, 2024

The ninth meeting of the Blue Ribbon Task Force on Student Screen Time began at 4:00 p.m. on October 17, 2024. The meeting was virtual.

Co-Chairs: Principal Brian Houghton and Student Ava Gustin.

Statement of Purpose

Develop guidance/recommendations, based in research, on:

- students' personal device use in school,
- screen time and mental health, and
- parental oversight of district-owned devices.

Calendar for meetings

October 17: Personal Device and Mental Health recommendations

- October 24: Mental Health and Parental Oversight recommendations
- October 31: No Meeting, read draft report
- November 7: Present final report and voting

November 12 at 10:55 a.m.: Report presented to State Board of Education by Co-Chairs

<u>Welcome from Commissioner Watson</u> Dr. Watson welcomed the members of the task force.

Co-Chair Student Ava Gustin greeted everyone and asked Payton Lynn to review the two documents that were sent out to the task force on October 16th.

Payton Lynn screen shared the document on Recommendations and then on Voting Procedures:

START 03:35

Task Force Recommendations and Voting Procedures Overview

How Motions Will Work

The task force will have all the recommended motions available in the Motion Recommendation document. The motions will be in a specific order to help with efficiency. We ordered the recommendations based on two things: (1) items that had a large majority and (2) ordered in a way that does not contradict another.

How Voting Will Work

After a motion is presented and seconded, there will be up to 10 minutes for discussion. Individuals will be called upon after raising their hand. Once the discussion ends or time runs out, a voting poll will appear on your screen where you can choose to vote 'yes,' 'no,' or abstain. Please note, abstentions will be recorded but not counted toward the majority vote requirement. A motion passes if it receives a majority of 'yes' votes among the total 'yes' and 'no' votes. For example, if 30 people vote and 5 abstain, only 25 votes are counted, requiring 13 'yes' votes for a majority.

General Discussion (Breakout Rooms - 10 min):

Discuss your thoughts, weigh the pros and cons of the recommendations, and consider the following guiding questions:

- Does the research support this recommendation?
- Does this recommendation empower local control?
- Who bears the responsibility for enforcing this recommendation?
- Does it place an excessive or unrealistic burden on any group?
- Are there financial implications?
- Is it realistic in both theory and practice?
- Are we aware of potential benefits or success stories related to the recommendation?
- Does this fall within the authority of the KS State Board of Education?

Voting Cadence

- Recommendations presented by co-chairs
- Motion opportunity
- Open discussion (Max 10 min)
- Vote: Yes, No, or Abstain

Co-Chair student Ava explained that because there was a breakout discussion on the personal device topic last week, it would not be repeated this week. Co-Chair Principal Houghton noted that during discussion, members of the task force will need to raise their hands (in the app) and be called on by one of the chairs. Members should not interrupt others who are speaking. If there is continuous interruption, muting or removal from the meeting will be necessary.

Ava referred to the Motion Recommendations document (inserted below), explaining that next to each recommendation is a note showing where, breakout room or submission by task force member, this particular idea came from. Also, the document is re-formatted to group together similar motions.

Principal Houghton stated that motions can be amended, as a friendly amendment if the originator of the motion agrees.

| Personal Devices Motion Recommendations | | | |
|--|---|---|--|
| Motion # /Origin | Motion | Final Vote | |
| 1 Breakout Room | Elementary School: Personal Device Policy Bell to Bell Policy: Elementary schools implement a bell-to- bell (beginning of the school day to the end of the school day) personal device ban, including electronic devices such as smart watches, wireless headphones etc., for students. (25/30 members in favor) | 25 in Favor 3 Opposed 1 Abstained | |
| 2 Option A: Member Submission Option B: Break out room | Elementary School: Storage Policy Option A: Locally Defined Policy Recommend districts adopt a policy for elementary schools on personal device storage, but the content of the policy should be left to the district. (8/25 members very or extremely interested, 2.92 average rating) Option B: Designated Location and Inaccessible Recommend elementary students store personal devices in a secure location not accessible to them during the school day. (22/30 members in favor) Option C: No Recommendation (No motion necessary) Provide no recommendation on storage policies for elementary schools. | | |

Personal Devices Motions

| Option A: Member SubmissionOption A: Locally Defined Policy Recommend districts adopt a policy for middle schools on personal device use, but the content of the policy should be left to the district. (#25 members very or extremely interested, 2.92 average rating)Option B: Breakout RoomOption F: Bell to Bell Recommend middle schools implement a bell-to-bell policy for a phone free school. (24/30 members in favor)Option C: Breakout RoomOption C: Designated Use Recommend that middle school students be allowed to have personal devices at designated time during the day. (5/30 members in favor)4Middle School: Storage PolicyOption A: Normal devices at designated time during the day. (S/30 members in favor)4Middle School: Storage PolicyOption B: SubmissionOption A: Locally Defined Policy Recommend districts adopt a policy for middle schools on personal devices at designated time during the school son personal devices at designated use policy should be left to the district. (#/25 members very or extremely interested, 2.92 average rating)Option B: Break roomOption B: Designated Location and Inaccessible Recommend middle school students store personal devices in a secure location not accessible to them during the school day. (23/30 members in favor)Option C: Define C: No Recommendation (No motion necessary) Provide no recommendation on storage policies for middle schools. | 3 | Middle School: Personal Device Policy | |
|--|----------|---|--|
| Option B: Breakout RoomRecommend middle schools implement a bell-to-bell policy for a phone free school. (24/30 members in favor)Option C: Breakout Room Option C: Designated Use Recommend that middle school students be allowed to have personal devices at designated time during the day. (5/30 members in favor)4Middle School: Storage PolicyOption A: Member Submission Option A: Locally Defined Policy Recommend districts adopt a policy for middle schools on personal device storage, but the content of the policy should be left to the district. (8/25 members very or extremely interested, 2.92 average rating)Option B: Break room Option B: Designated Location and Inaccessible Recommend middle school students store personal devices in a secure location not accessible to them during the school day. (23/30 members in favor)Option C: No Recommendation (No motion necessary) Provide no | Member | Recommend districts adopt a policy for middle schools on personal device use, but the content of the policy should be left to the district. | |
| Option C: Breakout RoomRecommend that middle school students be allowed to have personal devices at designated time during the day. (5/30 members in favor)4Middle School: Storage Policy0Option A: Locally Defined Policy Recommend districts adopt a policy for middle schools on personal device storage, but the content of the policy should be | Breakout | Recommend middle schools implement a bell-to-bell policy for a phone free school. | |
| Option A: Member SubmissionOption A: Locally Defined Policy Recommend districts adopt a policy for middle schools on personal device storage, but the content of the policy should be left to the district. (8/25 members very or extremely interested, 2.92 average rating)Option B: Break roomOption B: Designated Location and Inaccessible Recommend middle school students store personal devices in a secure location not accessible to them during the school day. (23/30 members in favor)Option C: No Recommendation (No motion necessary) Provide no | Breakout | Recommend that middle school students be allowed to have personal devices at designated time during the day. | |
| Member SubmissionRecommend districts adopt a policy for middle schools on personal device storage, but the content of the policy should be left to the district. (8/25 members very or extremely interested, 2.92 average rating)Option B: Break roomOption B: Designated Location and Inaccessible Recommend middle school students store personal devices in a secure location not accessible to them during the school day. (23/30 members in favor)Option C: No Recommendation (No motion necessary) Provide no | 4 | Middle School: Storage Policy | |
| Option B: Break roommiddle school students store personal devices in a secure location not accessible to them during the school day. (23/30 members in favor)Option C: No Recommendation (No motion necessary) Provide no | Member | Recommend districts adopt a policy for middle schools on personal device storage, but the content of the policy should be left to the district. | |
| | Break | middle school students store personal devices in a secure location not accessible to them during the school day. (23/30 | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| 5 | High School: Personal Device Policy | |
|-----------------------------------|--|--|
| Option A: Member Submission | Option A: Locally Defined Policy Recommend districts adopt a policy for high schools on personal device storage, but the content of the policy should be left to the district. (8/25 members very or extremely interested, 2.92 average rating) | |
| Option B: Breakout Room | Option B: Bell to Bell Recommend high schools implement a bell-to-bell policy for a phone free school. (16/30 members in favor) | |
| Option C: Breakout Room | Option C: Designated Use Recommend that high school students be allowed to have personal devices at designated time during the day. (15/30 members in favor) | |
| 6 | High School: Storage Policy | |
| Option A: Member Submission | Option A: Locally Defined Policy Recommend districts adopt a policy for high schools on personal device storage, but the content of the policy should be left to the district. (8/25 members very or extremely interested, 2.92 average rating) | |
| Option B: Breakout room | Option B: Designated Location and Inaccessible Recommend high school students store personal devices in a secure location not accessible to them during the school day. (18/30 members in favor) Option C: No Recommendation (No motion necessary) Provide no recommendation on storage policies for high schools. | |
| | | |

| 7 | Emergency Management | |
|-----------------------------------|--|------|
| Option A: Member Submission | Option A: Device-Independent Safety Plan Recommend districts to develop robust safety and emergency procedures that are not dependent on students contacting authorities or family via personal devices. (24/25 members very or extremely interested, 4.68 average rating) | |
| Option B: Member Submission | Option B: Off and Locked Away Advising districts that personal devices should be off and locked away during an emergency. (14/25 members very or extremely interested, 3.64 average rating) | |
| Option C: Member Submission | Option C: Locally Defined Policy Recommend districts adopt a policy that addresses personal device use during emergency scenarios, but the content of the policy should be left to the district. | |
| | Option D: No Recommendation (No motion necessary) Provide no recommendation on emergency management. | |
| 8 | Exemptions | |
| Option A: Breakout Room | Option A: Exemption Policy Recommend exemption policies be developed for students with IEPs, 504 plans, or related health and educational plans, when specified in plan. (23/30 very or extremely interested, 4.20 average rating) | |
| | Option B: No Recommendation (No motion necessary) Provide no recommendation on exemptions. | |
| 9 | Personal Devices vs. Phone-Free | |
| Member Submission | Amend the question about phone-free school option to include personal devices such as ear pods, headphones, smart watches, etc. (17/25 very or extremely interested, 4.13 average rating) | |
| | | |

| 10 | Personal Devices as Supplementation | |
|-----------------------------------|---|--|
| Option A: Member Submission | Option A: Personal Devices as Supplementation Recommend that districts develop a process for teachers to report gaps in district- provided technology, so teachers do not supplement lack of or insufficient district-issued technology with use of personal devices. (16/25 very or extremely interested, 3.96 average rating) Option B: No Recommendation (No motion necessary) Provide no recommendation on this topic. | |
| 11 | Staff Personal Device Policy | |
| Option A: Member Submission | Option A: Staff Personal Device Policy Recommend that districts create a personal device policy for staff. (15/25 very or extremely interested, 3.72 average rating) Option B: No Recommendation (No motion necessary) Provide no recommendation on this topic. | |
| 12 | Personal Property Infringement | |
| Option A: Member Submission | Option A: Personal Property Infringement Recommend that guidance describe what we want students to do vs. what not to do, and not infringe upon personal property. (4/25 very or extremely interested, 2.42 average rating) Option B: No Recommendation (No motion necessary) Provide no recommendation on this topic. | |

Ava referred to the Motion Recommendations document (inserted below), explaining that next to each recommendation is a note showing where, breakout room or submission by task force member, this particular idea came from. Also, the document is re-formatted to group together similar motions.

Principal Houghton stated that motions can be amended, as a friendly amendment if the originator of the motion agrees.

Voting Procedures Overview

How Motions Will Work

The task force will have all the recommended motions available in the Motion Recommendation document. The motions will be in a specific order to help with efficiency. We ordered the recommendations based on two things: (1) items that had a large majority and (2) ordered in a way that does not contradict another.

How Voting Will Work

After a motion is presented and seconded, there will be up to 10 minutes for discussion. Individuals will be called upon after raising their hand. Once the discussion ends or time runs out, a voting poll will appear on your screen where you can choose to vote 'yes,' 'no,' or abstain. Please note, abstentions will be recorded but not counted toward the majority vote requirement. A motion passes if it receives a majority of 'yes' votes among the total 'yes' and 'no' votes. For example, if 30 people vote and 5 abstain, only 25 votes are counted, requiring 13 'yes' votes for a majority. General Discussion (Breakout Rooms - 10 min):

Discuss your thoughts, weigh the pros and cons of the recommendations, and consider the following guiding questions:

- Does the research support this recommendation?
- Does this recommendation empower local control?
- Who bears the responsibility for enforcing this recommendation?
- Does it place an excessive or unrealistic burden on any group?
- Are there financial implications?
- Is it realistic in both theory and practice?
- Are we aware of potential benefits or success stories related to the recommendation?
- Does this fall within the authority of the KS State Board of Education?

Voting Cadence

- Recommendations presented by co-chairs
- Motion opportunity
- Open discussion (Max 10 min)
- Vote: Yes, No, or Abstain

Gabrielle Hull shared the KSDE definitions and report format. Report Writing will be using the following definitions:

- Definition Section
 - Personal Electronic Devices: Electronic devices capable of wi-fi and/or Bluetooth connectivity such as cell phones, tablets, smart watches, wireless headphones, or fitness trackers.
 - Bell to Bell: Personal electronic devices are off throughout the school day, including during lunch and in between classes
- Personal Device Recommendation Section:
 - The Task Force recommends elementary schools implement a bell-to-bell personal electronic policy for students.

Voting Procedures Overview

> Report 09:15

| | 1 |
|--|---|
| Chair Ava asked the Task Force to make a recommendation on motion #2: | |
| Amy Warren moved that the Blue Ribbon Task Force on Student Screen Time recommend elementary students store personal devices in a secure location not accessible to them during the school day. Representative Scott Hill seconded the motion. Motion carried 25-3 with 1 abstention. | Motion #2 Elem Accessibility |
| Representative Scott Hill moved that the Blue Ribbon Task Force on Student Screen Time recommend middle schools implement a bell-to-bell policy for a phone free school. Carol Budde seconded the motion. Motion carried 28-4 with no abstentions. | Motion #3 Middle School Bell to Bell |
| Lori Barnes moved that the Blue Ribbon Task Force on Student Screen Time recommend that middle school students store personal devices in a secure location not accessible to them during the school day. Constance Martin seconded the motion. Motion carried 27-5 with no abstentions. | Motion #4 Middle School accessibility |
| Senator Chase Blasi moved that the Blue Ribbon Task Force on Student Screen Time recommend that high schools implement a bell-to-bell policy for a phone free school. Kim Whitman seconded the motion. Motion carried 24-8 with no abstentions. | Motion #5 High School Bell to Bell |
| Katie Allen moved that the Blue Ribbon Task Force on Student Screen Time recommend that high school students store personal devices in a secure location not accessible to them during the school day. Kim Whitman seconded the motion. Motion carried 23-8 with 1 abstention. | Motion #6 High School accessibility |
| Katie Allen moved that the Blue Ribbon Task Force on Student Screen Time recommend districts develop robust safety and emergency procedures that are not dependent on students contacting authority or family via personal devices or school issued devices. Lyndsay Noble seconded the motion. Motion carried 27-4 with 2 abstentions. | Motion #7 Emergency procedures |
| The Co-Chairs thanked the Task Force and adjourned the meeting. | |
| The next meeting will be October 24, 2024, at 4:00 online. | |